

---

**MINUTES  
OF THE MEETING OF THE  
NOTTINGHAMSHIRE POLICE AND CRIME COMMISSIONER  
JOINT AUDIT AND SCRUTINY PANEL  
HELD ON TUESDAY 6 JUNE 2017  
ARNOT HILL HOUSE,  
ARNOLD, NOTTINGHAMSHIRE NG5 6LU  
COMMENCING AT 10.00 AM**

---

**MEMBERSHIP**

(A – denotes absent)

Mr Stephen Charnock (Chair)  
Mr Leslie Ayoola - A  
Mr John Brooks  
Dr Phil Hodgson- A  
Mr Peter McKay

**OFFICERS PRESENT**

Rachel Barber	Deputy Chief Constable
Pete Barker	Democratic Services, Notts County Council
Paul Dawkins	Assistant Chief Finance Officer
Alison Fawley	Democratic Services, Notts County Council
Mark Kimberley	Head of Finance, Notts Police
Charlotte Radford	Chief Finance Officer, OPCC
Paddy Tipping	Police & Crime Commissioner
Brian Welch	Mazars

**1) APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Leslie Ayoola, Philip Hodgson, Andrew Cardoza and Craig Guildford.

**2) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS AND OFFICERS**

None.

**3) MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING**

The minutes of the last meeting held on 9 March 2017, having been circulated to all Members, were taken as read and were confirmed and were signed by the Chair.

The Panel expressed concern that they had not had the opportunity to review several of the papers for the agenda and said that this practice was

unacceptable. Charlie Radford said that an explanation would be provided when the items were introduced.

#### **4) AUDIT & SCRUTINY PANEL WORKSHOP – VERBAL UPDATE**

The Chair reflected on the recent workshop which had reviewed the effectiveness of the Panel and considered different ways of working including issues of resourcing and the provision of timely reports. Discussions were underway to make better use of the information already available and to develop a dashboard system to provide a level of assurance for major topic areas.

Panel Members had considered the terms of reference for the Panel and comments and suggestions had been incorporated into a revised document. The Chair asked Members to consider and comment on the revised terms of reference prior to it being forwarded to the PCC & CC for sign off.

The workshop also considered how an Assurance Map and a dashboard of performance could be used to assist the work of the Panel. It was noted that this work was still at a developmental stage was aiming for implementation in September 2017.

##### **Actions:**

To review the statutory responsibilities of the panel and identify the reporting methodology, source of assurance and responsible personnel.

To compare with other Panels in the region.

To develop the use of the assurance map and dashboard to inform the workplan and agenda

Panel member to comment on the revised document.

#### **5) INTERNAL AUDIT ANNUAL ASSURANCE REPORT 2016-17**

Brian Welch introduced the annual report which provided Members with the assurance from Internal Audit work undertaken during the year 2016-17. He highlighted that the overall opinion for both PCC & Force was that generally adequate and effective risk management, control and governance processes were in place to manage the achievement of objectives but weaknesses had been identified that needed addressing. A few audits had limited assurance but were not necessarily Nottinghamshire specific as they related to EMSCU.

During discussions and questions the following points were raised:

- Mr Welch confirmed that the definitions for the grading of opinions came from CIPFA.
- The Annual Report was a summary of audits that had previously been to the Audit & Scrutiny Panel.
- The Panel discussed how audits were scoped and whether there needed to be more detailed. Mr Welch explained the process used prior to undertaking an audit and the importance of service user involvement at an early stage.
- Mr Welch advised Panel Members that planned audits were listed in the Audit Plan and any particular issues and or requests to be involved in the scoping should be directed to him as soon as possible.

**RESOLVED: 2017/010**

That the report be noted.

**6) DRAFT OPCC AND GROUP FINAL STATUTORY ACCOUNTS AND**

**7) DRAFT ANNUAL GOVERNANCE STATEMENTS**

Charlotte Radford introduced the report which provided Panel Members with a copy of the audited statement of accounts and annual governance statements for 2016-17.

She explained that production of the statements had been challenging due to staff sickness but were ahead of schedule compared to last year. Additional staff had been trained so that the problem would not occur in the future. CIPFA were developing a system which would simplify the production of accounts in future years and Nottinghamshire was a pilot authority. Mrs Radford was confident that statutory deadlines would be met this year and in the future.

Copies of the reports were circulated to Members who were asked to provide feedback via email within two weeks.

During discussion and questions the following points were raised:

- Improvements in financial administration had resulted in expenditure remaining below budget in 2016-17 and the underspend had made a greater than anticipated contribution to reserves,
- The rate of staff leaving had been faster than predicted but had not impacted on Police performance. It would be a challenge to get new recruits in to the system so that operational performance was not affected.
- Mr Kimberley explained to the Panel the steps that had been taken to ensure that robust monitoring systems were in place and that more detail was incorporated in building budget estimates.
- Problems had occurred with the production of the capital accounts and revised copies of the statements would be circulated when the information was available.
- Reports had been through internal processes and FEB and included their comments but were still in draft format. Comments were needed from Audit & Scrutiny Panel prior to sign off.
- Paul Dawkins would check the reports for consistency across the three forces

**RESOLVED: 2017/011**

**That:**

- 1) Members reviewed the tabled draft documents and provided feedback on items which should be amended or included in the Statements of Accounts for the Chief Constable and the Police and Crime Commissioner
- 2) Members reviewed the tabled draft annual governance statements and provided feedback for the Chief Constable and Police and Crime Commissioner.

**Actions:**

Panel members to provide comments on the draft documents.

## **8) INTERNAL AUDIT PROGRESS REPORT**

Brian Welch introduced the report which provided members with an update on the progress made against the Internal Audit Annual Plan for 2017-18 and the findings from audits completed to date.

Mr Welch highlighted that since the last Audit & Scrutiny Panel meeting, three final reports in respect of 2016-17 audits for Nottinghamshire had been issued as well as the final two audits for the Collaboration. A summary of the work carried out, key findings and the assurance opinions were included in appendix 1 of his report.

During discussion and questions the following points were raised:

- Mr Welch confirmed that the audit team would check that agreed management actions had been completed as stated and he felt that a separate tracker would be a duplication of work as the information was reported through the quarterly Audit & Inspection report. The Chair felt that this was an area for development and would discuss with Julie Mair.
- A customer satisfaction survey was sent to auditees at the end of each audit but the response rate was low. It was felt that the survey should be issued independently by the Audit & Inspection team who should encourage feedback to ensure a better response rate.
- The Panel was concerned at the number of priority 2 recommendations for the Risk Management audit particularly as they may have taken assurance from reports presented by A&I team but were assured by Charlie Radford that at the time of the audit the department was in a state of flux and had made significant progress since.

### **RESOLVED: 2017/012**

That the contents of the report be noted.

#### **Actions**

To review how completion of management actions is reported to A&S Panel  
To identify alternative methods for ensuring feedback is obtained for every report commissioned

## **12) PANEL WORK PLAN AND MEETING SCHEDULE**

The Panel work plan was currently under review and would be presented at the next meeting.

The next meeting would be held on Thursday 27 July 2017 at 2.00pm

The meeting closed at 11.30am

CHAIR